

Saṅgārava Sutta – The Discourse to Saṅgārava

"*Saṅgārava Sutta*" appears altogether seven times in the ancient strata of Pāli scriptures. However, the *Saṅgārava Sutta* of *Majjhima Nikāya 100* has no duplicate of the same name, although there is a complementary version in *Samyutta Nikāya*. The brahmin Saṅgārava in the *Majjhima Nikāya sutta* seems to be different from all those mentioned in the other discourses. See below in brief what the other *Saṅgārava Suttas* are about and where exactly they occur.

SN 1.7.2.11. Saṅgārava Sutta – ven. Ānanda sees a brahmin, (Comy.: a friend from ven. Ānanda's lay life), as the brahmin enthusiastically practices ablution (purification of sins by water). Ven. Ānanda then asks the Buddha to teach Dhamma for his friend, upon which the Buddha approaches the brahmin, recites a verse of Dhamma about the benefits of virtue, and the brahmin then vows to be the Buddha's lay follower for life.

SN 5.2.6.5. Saṅgārava Sutta & AN 5.4.5.3. Saṅgārava Sutta – The brahmin Saṅgārava's background is not explained either in the *SN* or in the *AN* version, but it is possible that it is the same brahmin Saṅgārava as in the previous *Saṅgārava Sutta* of *SN*, i.e. SN 1.7.2.11. Saṅgārava Sutta. The brahmin asks the Buddha why some memorized texts are sometimes easily remembered even when difficult, and why are some text soon forgotten even if they seemed to be easy to remember. The Buddha explains that it depends on the presence of the five hindrances in the mind (i.e. sensual desire, ill will, sloth and torpor, restlessness and anxiety, and doubt).

AN 3.2.1.10. Saṅgārava Sutta – Brahmin Saṅgārava approaches the Buddha with the idea that those who practice sacrifice and enjoin others to practice sacrifice benefit many living beings, whereas anyone who becomes an ascetic benefit only themselves. The Buddha then explains that He Himself benefits many hundreds of thousands by teaching the unsurpassed culmination of the spiritual life. Ven. Ānanda then asks the brahmin which of the two (sacrificing or ascetic life) seems simpler and less harmful, and the brahmin refuses to answer. The Buddha then explains to the brahmin the three psychic powers ((1) self-multiplication, element transformation, (2) telepathy, and (3) teaching virtuous life) and acknowledges that He and many of His disciples have attained them. The brahmin then becomes the Buddha's lay follower for life. The brahmin Saṅgārava, according to the Pāli Commentary, was a superintendent of construction (building) repairs in the city of Rājagaha.

AN 10.3.2.5. Saṅgārava Sutta – The text here doesn't provide us with any further information about the brahmin Saṅgārava. The brahmin approaches the Buddha and asks him what is "near shore" and "far shore". The Buddha then explains that the eight factors of the Eight-Fold Noble Path if practiced wrongly they are the "near shore", and if they are practiced correctly, they are the "far shore". (Here "far shore" means the transcending of all suffering and rebirth, attainment of ultimate Enlightenment.) The discourse ends with eulogy of the Enlightened beings.

AN 10.4.2.3. Saṅgārava Sutta – The text here also doesn't provide any information about the brahmin Saṅgārava. It seems to be a different version of the previous *Saṅgārava Sutta* in *AN 10.3.2.5*. The brahmin here also asks what is "near shore" and "far shore", and the Buddha answers that the "near shore" is breaking the five precepts (i.e. killing, stealing, sexual misconduct, false speech, and drinking alcohol), and the "far shore" is following the five precepts (i.e. not killing, not stealing, no sexual misconduct, no false speech, no drinking alcohol). The discourse finishes with the same eulogic verses as the *Saṅgārava Sutta* of *AN 10.3.2.5*.

A complementary version of the *Majjhima Nikāya's Saṅgārava Sutta* appears in SN 1.7.1.1. Dhanañjānī Sutta, which describes how the husband of the brahmin woman Dhanañjānī approached the Buddha with the intention to accuse Him of a mistake, whereas the *Majjhima Nikāya's Saṅgārava Sutta* describes how the youngest brother of her husband, brahmin Saṅgārava, questioned the Buddha's wisdom. After their attempts to test the Buddha, both of them asked to be accepted and ordained as the Buddha's monastic disciples, as monks, and soon after that became Arahants. Large part of the Commentary to the *Dhanañjānī Sutta* is supplementary to the introduction of the *Saṅgārava Sutta*, hence that part is included in this translation, inserted at the end of the introductory part.

The Translation of Saṅgārava Sutta and the Related Commentaries

Introductory Part

MN 100. Saṅgārava Sutta	MN 100. The Discourse to Saṅgārava
473. Evam me sutam – ekam samayam bhagavā kosalesu cārikam carati mahatā bhikkhusaṅghena saddhim.	473. Thus was heard by me – on one occasion the Exalted One journeys on a journey in (the kingdom of) Kosala, together with a Community of monks.
Tena kho pana samayena dhanañjāni ¹ nāma brāhmaṇī cañcalikappe ² [maṇḍalakappe (sī.), paccalakappe (syā. kam.), caṇḍalakappe (pī.)] paṭivasati abhippasannā buddhe ca dhamme ca saṅghe ca.	At that time, indeed, the brahmin woman named Dhanañjāni ³ dwelled in Cañcalikappa, devoted to the Buddha, the Dhamma, ⁴ and the Saṅgha ⁵ as well.

MNA 100. Saṅgāravasuttavaṇṇanā	Commentary to MN 100. Discourse to Saṅgārava
473. Evam me sutanti saṅgāravasuttam.	473. "Thus was heard by me" means the Discourse to Saṅgārava.
Tattha cañcalikappeti evamnāmake gāme.	There "Cañcalikappa" means in a village of that name.
Abhippasannāti aveccappasādavasena pasannā.	"Devoted" means she had unshakeable faith (in the Buddha, Dhamma, and Saṅgha.)
Sā kira sotāpannā ariyasāvikā bhāradvājagottassa brāhmanassa bhariyā.	She, indeed, (was) a Stream-Enterer, a Noble Disciple, (and) the wife of the brahmin of Bhāradvāja clan.
So brāhmaṇo pubbe kālena kālam brāhmaṇe nimantetvā tesam sakkāraṇ karoti.	That brahmin (would) previously every now and then invite brahmins (home) and treat them (by meal).
Imam pana brāhmaṇīm gharaṇī ānetvā abhirūpāya mahākulāya brāhmaṇiyā cittam kopetum asakkonto brāhmaṇānam sakkāraṇ kātum nāsakkhi.	However, after (the brahmin) brought this brahmin woman home (i.e. married her), (the brahmin) was unable to turn the mind of the beautiful brahmin lady of a powerful family (from thoughts about the Buddha), and (therefore) was unable to treat the brahmins (as before). ⁶
Atha naṁ brāhmaṇā ditthadiṭṭhāne – "nayidāni tvam brāhmaṇaladdhiko, ekāhampi brāhmaṇānam sakkāraṇ na karosi"ti nippilenti.	Then, whenever the brahmins would see him, (they) pestered (him) : "now you are not a brahmin of gain, you don't treat brahmins even a single day."
So gharaṇī āgantvā brāhmaṇiyā tamattham ārocetvā – "sace, bhoti ekadivasaṇ mukham rakkhitum	He came home, told about that issue to the brahmin woman, and said: "if (you), lady, manage to guard

¹ In Sinhalese and PTS versions there is "dhānañjāni" (Dhānañjāni).

² In Sinhalese version there is "maṇḍalakappe" (in Maṇḍalakappa), in Thai and Cambodian "paccalakappe" (in Paccalakappa), and in PTS version there is "caṇḍalakappe" (in Caṇḍalakappa).

³ The brahmin lady Dhanañjāni, as we learn from the Commentaries, was a Stream-Enterer (*Sotāpanna*), hence she had unshakeable faith in the Buddha, Dhamma, and Saṅgha. She was the wife of a brahmin who was from Bhāradvāja clan.

⁴ i.e. the Buddha's Teachings.

⁵ i.e. the Community of the Buddha's monastic disciples: monks and nuns.

⁶ I.e. the brahmin lady was so faithful to the Buddha, Dhamma, and Saṅgha, that it seemed impossible to persuade her to cooperate in invitation of non-Buddhist brahmins.

<i>sakkuṇeyyāsi, brāhmaṇānam ekadivasaṁ bhikkhaṁ dadeyya"nti āha.</i>	(your) mouth, one day (I) might make a donation for brahmins."
<i>Tuyhaṁ deyyadhammaṁ ruccanakaṭṭhāne dehi, kiṁ mayhaṁ etthāti.</i>	"Give your donation wherever it pleases (you). What (shall) I do there?" ⁷

<i>Atha kho dhanañjānī brāhmaṇī upakkhalitvā tikkhattum udānam udānesi –</i>	Then, indeed, the brahmin woman Dhanañjānī stumbled and exclaimed an exclamation three times:
<i>"namo tassa bhagavato arahato sammāsambuddhassa. Namo tassa bhagavato arahato sammāsambuddhassa. Namo tassa bhagavato arahato sammāsambuddhassā"ti.</i>	"I bow to Him, the Exalted One, the One Worthy (of offerings), the Rightly and Thoroughly Awakened (to the truth of the world). I bow to Him, the Exalted One, the One Worthy (of offerings), the Rightly and Thoroughly Awakened (to the truth of the world). I bow to Him, the Exalted One, the One Worthy (of offerings), the Rightly and Thoroughly Awakened (to the truth of the world)."

<i>So brāhmaṇe nimantetvā appodakaṁ pāyāsaṁ pacāpetvā gharañca sujjhāpetvā āsanāni paññāpetvā brāhmaṇe nisīdāpesi.</i>	He (i.e. the brahmin) invited brahmins, asked (his wife ⁸) to cook milk-rice of little water, to clean the house as well, and after (he) asked (his wife) to prepare seats, (he) asked the brahmins to sit (there).
<i>Brāhmaṇī mahāsāṭakam nivāsetvā kaṭacchum gahetvā parivisanti dussakanṇake pakkhalitvā</i>	The brahmin woman took on a large garment, took a ladle, and as (she) served (the brahmins), (she) stumbled over a corner of the cloth (of her garment), ⁹
<i>"brāhmaṇe parivisāmī"ti saññampi akatvā</i>	And not keeping in mind (the thought) "I am serving the brahmins",
<i>āsevanavasena sahasā satthārameva anussaritvā udānam udānesi.</i>	And because of the habit, (she) hurriedly remembered the Master and exclaimed the exclamation.

<i>Tena kho pana samayena saṅgāravo nāma māṇavo cañcalikappe pativasati tiṇṇam vedānam pāragu sanighāṇḍuketubhānam sākkharappabhedānam</i>	Indeed, at that time the young man named Saṅgārava dwelled in Cañcalikappa, accomplished in (1) the Three <i>Vedas</i> , (2) vocabulary, (3) literary composition, (4) grammar, and (5) history as the fifth (lore); ¹⁰ chanter,
--	---

⁷ According to the Sub-Commentary, the brahmin woman – being a Stream-Enterer – was free from the blemish of envy, hence she could be supportive of both the Buddha and the brahmins.

⁸ From the later mention in this Commentary to the *Saṅgārava Sutta (MNA 100)* - "*ettakarṇ te khīrañca tanḍulādīni ca nāsitāni*"ti = "now ("this much") is your milk and rice in vain" - it seems that it was the wife of the brahmin, the brahmin woman Dhanañjānī, who cooked the milk-rice. According to the Commentary to the *Dhanañjānī Sutta (SNA 1.7.1.1.)* it however seems that the brahmin woman Dhanañjānī didn't cook anything – "*Tayā aññānam kiñci kātabbam natthi, sabbaṁ pacanaparivesanam aññe karissanti.*" = "There is no other duty to be done by you, other (people) will do all the cooking and serving."

⁹ Note here that according to this Commentary the brahmin woman stumbled over a corner of her garment, whereas according to the Commentary of *SN 1.7.1.1. Dhānañjānīsutta*, the brahmin woman stumbled over a wrongly placed wooden piece of furniture.

¹⁰ The five lores of ancient brahmins were, paraphrasing from the English translation made by the Burmese (in "*Majjhima Nikāya - Medium Length Discourses of the Buddha, A Translation of Majjhimapāṇṇāsa Pāli*", by U Htin Fatt, Department for

the Promotion and Propagation of the Sāsanā, Yangon, 2008; p.586, PDF p.601) namely - (1) *vedattaya* (Three Vedas), (2) *nighaṇḍu* (vocabulary), (3) *ketubha* (literary composition), (4) *akkharappabheda* (grammar), and (5) *itihāsa* (history).

Bhikkhu Bodhi however accepts Bhikkhu Nāṇamoli's translation (in "The Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha, A Translation of the Majjhima Nikāya", Bhikkhu Nāṇamoli and Bhikkhu Bodhi, Wisdom Publications, Boston, 2009; p.819) as "Three Vedas, with their vocabularies, liturgy, phonology, and etymology, and the histories as the fifth". The most detailed explanation of the five lores is found in *Vinayapiṭaka Tīkā – Vimativinodanī – Bāhiranidānakathā - Tatiyasarigītikathāvanṇanā* (MM vol.1 p.26). The correct understanding of the Pāli grammar is explained thus:

1. The five lores are understood including the Three Vedas, *not* as separate from them: "*tayo vedā, tesu itihāsapāñcamesu*" – "the Three *Vedas*, by them (it is) with history as the fifth." The Three *Vedas* are the first lore of the five, they are not superordinate to the other four (or five in Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation).

2. *Ketubha* is literary composition, *not* liturgy. "Liturgy" (according to OED on CD-ROM, Oxford University Press, 2009) is "A form of public worship, esp. in the Christian Church; a collection of formularies for the conduct of Divine service.". The Pāli-Burmese dictionary explains that *ketubha* is the book of poems (ကမ္မဖွဲ့ထုံးကျမ်း၊ အလက်ကျမ်း); and the *kiriyākappavikappa* which characterizes the poems is "the composition of poems related to actions of wise men" (ပညာရှိတို့၏ အမှုအရဟု ဆိုအပ်သော ကမ္မဖွဲ့ခြင်း အစီအရင်). The explanation of *Vimativinodanī Tīkā* goes: "*Ketubhanti kiṭati gameti kiriyādivibhāganti ketubham, kiriyākappavikappo kavīnam upakārasattham. Ettha ca kiriyākappavikappoti vacibhedādilakkhaṇā kiriyā kappiyati vikappiyati etenāti kiriyākappo, so pana vanṇapadabandhapadatthādivibhāgato bahuvikappoti "kiriyākappavikappo"ti vuccati. Idañca mūlakiriyākappaganthaṇ sandhāya vuttam.*" = "*Ketubha*" means "the analysis of actions such as arriving (*kiṭati*) (and) going (*gameti*) (of wise men), (hence it is called) *ketubha*. The thinking and considering the actions (of wise men) is the art instrumental in poetry. Also, there "thinking and considering the actions" (*kiriyākappavikappa*) means that by the work on distinctive characteristics of speech etc. there is thinking (and) considering, hence (it is called) "thinking (about) actions" (*kiriyākappavikappa*). It is in fact called "thinking and considering the actions" (because) of deep ("much") pondering over (poetic) elaboration(s) of connecting syllables (and) words (into verses), the meaning of the words, etc. It is also said in connection to the *Mūlakiriyākappagantha* (The Original Book of Ways of Action)." -> Therefore, "liturgy" is not a plausible translation. Correct translation is "literary/poetic composition", or (as we can see in U Htin Fatt's translation) "the art of writing".

3. "*Akkharappabheda*" is to be understood as one word (grammar/"distinction of syllables"), *not* as two words (*akkhara* - phonology and *pabheda* - etymology). Again, according to *Vimativinodanī Tīkā – Thānakaraṇādivibhāgato ca nibbacanavibhāgato ca akkharā pabhediyanti etenāti akkharappabhedo, sikkhā ca nirutti ca.* = "The syllables are divided/sorted by the analysis of the origin place of the sound (*thāna*), the tongue area where the sound is pronounced (*karaṇa*) etc., as well as by the analysis of the definition (of the syllables), hence (it is called) "distinction ("dividing"/"sorting") of syllables", (both) the training (of it), as well as the application ("utterance"). Bhikkhu Bodhi's translation of *akkharappabheda* as "phonology, and etymology" is ultimately correct, but in the context it should not be taken as two brahmanic lores; it is one lore only.

-- Note that the interpretation of Sub-Commentaries is essential for *Theravāda* tradition of Buddhists and especially monks, because it helps to prevent unnecessary misunderstandings. For example, due to the ignorance of Sub-Commentaries the Sinhalese monks few centuries ago had a bitter argument regarding ordination validity, a problem which would never occur in Myanmar. In Myanmar the great masters easily resolved the Sinhalese dispute by providing the Sinhalese monks with a number of quotes from Sub-Commentaries. It is the knowledge of Sub-Commentaries which helped the Burmese to be the most brilliant Buddhist meditators and scholars in the world.

¹¹ Bhikkhu Bodhi translates *lokāyata* as "natural philosophy". Natural philosophy of course is included in the Buddha's teachings as well, if we understand it as "the philosophy of nature". Therefore such translation makes no sense in the context. The Burmese interpretation says that it is the teachings of other philosophers and religious leaders of that time (စိဒ္ဓထို့၏ ကျမ်း, in Tipiṭaka Pāli-Burmese Dictionary, vol.18, p.297).

<p>Assosi kho saṅgāravo māṇavo dhanañjāniyā brāhmaṇiyā evaṁ vācaṁ bhāsamānāya.</p>	<p>Then, the young man Saṅgārava heard that utterance (i.e. the exclamation) told by the brahmin woman Dhanañjānī.</p>
<p><i>Sutvā dhanañjāniṁ brāhmaṇiṁ etadavoca – "avabhūtāva ayam¹² dhanañjānī brāhmaṇī, parabhūtāva¹³ ayam dhanañjānī brāhmaṇī, vijjamānānam tevijjānam¹⁴ brāhmaṇānam, atha ca pana tassa mundakassa samaṇakassa vaṇṇam bhāsissati"ti¹⁵.</i></p>	<p>After (the young man) heard (it), (he) told the brahmin woman Dhanañjānī this: "This brahmin woman Dhanañjānī is just retarded, this brahmin woman Dhanañjānī is just ruined for the knowledgeable brahmins of three proficiencies ("knowledges"),¹⁶ because (she) speaks praise for that bald-headed ascetic.</p>
<p><i>"Na hi pana tvam, tāta bhadramukha, tassa bhagavato sīlapaññānam jānāsi.</i></p>	<p>"You, however, dear beautiful-faced one¹⁷, don't know the virtue and wisdom of that Exalted One.</p>
<p><i>Sace tvam, tāta bhadramukha, tassa bhagavato sīlapaññānam jāneyyāsi, na tvam, tāta bhadramukha, tam bhagavantaṁ akkositabbaṁ paribhāsitabbaṁ maññeyyāsi"ti.</i></p>	<p>If you, dear beautiful-faced one, knew the virtue and wisdom of the Exalted One, you, dear beautiful-faced one, would not think of blaming (or) censuring the Exalted One.</p>
<p><i>"Tena hi, bhoti, yadā samaṇo gotamo cañcalikappam anuppatto hoti atha me āroceyyāsi"ti.</i></p>	<p>"Well then, lady, (you) should inform me when ("that day") the ascetic Gotama arrives in Cañcalikappa.</p>
<p><i>"Evaṁ, bhadramukhā"ti kho dhanañjānī brāhmaṇī saṅgāravassa mānavassa paccassosi.</i></p>	<p>"Yes¹⁸, beautiful-faced one" then replied the brahmin woman Dhanañjānī to the young man Saṅgārava.</p>

<p><i>Brāhmaṇā udānaṁ sutvā "ubhatopakkhiko esa samaṇassa gotamassa sahāyo, nāssa deyyadhammam gaṇhissāmā"ti kupitā bhojanāni chaḍdetvā nikkhamiṁsu.</i></p>	<p>The brahmins heard the exclamation, (and saying) : "(serving) both sides, (this brahmin is a) friend of that ascetic Gotama, we won't take donation from him," (the brahmins) were angry, threw away the food, and left.</p>
--	---

¹² Sinhalese, Thai, Cambodian, and PTS versions: "avabhūtā cayaṁ" ("this (brahmin woman) is also retarded").

¹³ Sinhalese, Thai, Cambodian, and PTS versions: "parabhūtā cayaṁ" ("this (brahmin woman) is also ruined").

¹⁴ The word "tevijjānam" ("of three powers/knowledges") does not appear in the Sinhalese, Thai, Cambodian, and PTS version.

¹⁵ Sinhalese, Thai, Kambodian, and PTS versions: "bhāsatiti".

¹⁶ *Tevijjānam* - of three knowledges, of three proficiencies. This word is also used for Buddhist monks, but unlike in brahmins, where the three knowledges mean the Three *Vedas*, in the case of Buddhist monks "Three Knowledges" are the psychic power of remembering their past lives, the vision of other beings born in different worlds according to their *kamma*, and the full comprehension of Four Noble Truths, i.e. complete eradication of all mental defilements. The word *vijjā* therefore may mean "knowledge", "psychic power", and "wisdom" as well. I therefore suggest "proficiency" as the word that could carry all the three meanings.

¹⁷ Bhikkhu Bodhi doesn't translate this word, keeping only "sir". According to *SNA – 1.3.1.7. Addakaranaśuttavannanā – "Bhadramukhoti sundaramukho."* = "bhādra mukha" means 'beautiful face/mouth.' Pāli-Burmese dictionary (vol.15, p.524) says: "(၁) ကောင်းသော မျက်နှာ၊ (၂) ကောင်းသော မျက်နှာ ရှိသောသူ" = "(1) good face; (2) person who has good face."

¹⁸ "Yes", according to the Oxford English Dictionary, stands "for the affirmative sentence corresponding to the interrogative one constituting the question: = 'It is so.' The Pāli word "evaṁ" usually means "thus" or "so", hence I suppose "yes" is a translation most direct and comprehensible as well.

<i>Brāhmaṇo¹⁹ – "nanu paṭhamamyeva tam avacāra 'ajjekadivasaṁ mukhaṁ rakkheyyāsi'ti, ettakam te khīrañca taṇḍulādīni ca nāsitāni'ti</i>	The brahmin (husband said) : "didn't (I) tell you already in the beginning, 'today you should guard (your) mouth for one day', now (/"this much") is your milk and rice in vain."
<i>ativiya kopavasaṁ upagato – "evameva panāyam vasalī yasmiṁ vā tasmīm vā tassa mundakassa samanassa vanṇam bhāsatī, idāni tyāhaṁ vasali tassa satthuno vādaṁ āropessāmī'ti āha.</i>	Getting extremely angry, (the brahmin then) said: "Thus, indeed, this scoundrel woman speaks praise for that bald-headed ascetic (who lives) somewhere away. Now I will accuse your teacher of a mistake, scoundrel woman!"
<i>Atha naṁ brāhmaṇī "gaccha tvam, brāhmaṇa, gantvā vijānissasi'ti vatvā</i>	Then the brahmin woman told him: "Go, you brahmin, when (you) have gone, you will learn,"
<i>"Na khvāhaṁ tam, brāhmaṇa, passāni sadevake loke samārake sabrahmake sassamaṇabrahmaṇiyā pajāya sadevamanussāya, yo tassa bhagavato vādaṁ āropeyyā"tiādimāha.²⁰</i>	Adding (/"saying") : "indeed, brahmin, I don't see in the world with gods, higher gods, Brahma, ascetics (and) brahmins, with those born of gods and men, who could (correctly) accuse that Exalted One of a mistake."
<i>So satthāram upasākamitvā –</i>	He (i.e. the brahmin woman's husband) approached the Teacher and asked (this) question:
<i>"Kiṁsu chetvā sukhaṁ seti, kiṁsu chetvā na socati;</i>	"What (should) be destroyed in order to have a pleasant sleep? What (should) be destroyed in order not to grieve?
<i>Kissassu ekadhammassa, vadham rocesi gotamā"ti. (saṁ. ni. 1.187) – Pañhaṁ pucchi.</i>	What would be that one thing, that (you) Gotama declare to be slain? (SN 1.7.1.1. Dhārañjānī Sutta)
<i>Satthā āha –</i>	The Teacher said:
<i>"Kodhaṁ chetvā sukhaṁ seti, kodhaṁ chetvā na socati;</i>	"Having destroyed anger, (one) has a pleasant sleep. Having destroyed anger, (one) doesn't grieve.
<i>Kodhassa visamūlassa, madhuraggassa brāhmaṇa;</i>	Of the anger that has a poisoned root (and) sweet tip, brahmin,
<i>Vadhaṁ ariyā pasāṁsanti, tañhi chetvā na socatī"ti. (saṁ. ni. 1.187) –</i>	Noble Ones praise the slaughter, if that is destroyed, (one) doesn't grieve." (SN 1.7.1.1. Dhārañjānī Sutta)
<i>Pañhaṁ kathesi. So pabbajitvā arahattam patto.</i>	(Thus the Buddha) answered (/"spoke") the question. He (i.e. the brahmin) was ordained and attained Arahanthood.
<i>Tasseva kaniṭṭhabhātā akkosakabhāradvājo nāma "bhātā me pabbajito"ti sutvā bhagavantam upasākamitvā akkositvā bhagavatā vinīto pabbajitvā arahattam patto.</i>	Even when his younger brother named Akkosaka Bhāradvāja (/"the blaming Bhāradvāja") heard "my brother is ordained", (he) approached the Exalted One, blamed (Him), and admonished by the Exalted One he (the brahmin) was ordained and attained Arahanthood.
<i>Aparo tassa kaniṭṭho sundarikabhāradvājo nāma.</i>	Another (was) his younger (brother) named Sundarika (i.e. "Beautiful") Bhāradvāja.
<i>Sopi bhagavantam upasākamitvā pañhaṁ pucchitvā vissajjanam sutvā pabbajitvā arahattam patto.</i>	He also approached the Exalted One, heard the answer, ordained (as a monk), and attained Arahanthood.

¹⁹ From here onward we learn the story-line of *Dhārañjānī Sutta*. Because this is a faithful rendering of the original, I believe it is sufficient for the present purposes.

²⁰ I have replaced the abbreviated version consisting of dots with the full version from *SN 1.7.1.1. Dhārañjānī Sutta*.

<i>Aparo tassa kaniṭṭho piṅgalabhbāradvājo nāma.</i>	Another (was) his younger (brother) named Piṅgalā (i.e. "Tawny").
<i>So pañham pucchitvā pañhabybākaraṇapariyosāne pabbajitvā arahattam patto.</i>	He asked (the Buddha) a question and at the end of the answer he ordained (as a monk) and attained Arahanthood.
<i>Saṅgāravo māṇavoti ayam tesam sabbakaniṭṭho tasmiṁ divase brāhmaṇehi saddhiṁ ekabhattagge nisinno.</i>	"The young mane Saṅgārava" means the youngest (brother) of them, (who) sat on that day (of Dhānañjāni's exclamation) together with (other) brahmins in one refectory.
<i>Avabhūtāvāti avaḍḍhibhūtā avamaṅgalabhbūtāyeva.</i>	"Retarded" means without progress, simply subject to bad omens.
<i>Parabhūtāvāti vināsaṁ pattāyeva.</i>	"Ruined" means simply fallen into destruction.
<i>Vijjamānānanti vijjamānesu.</i>	"For the knowledgeable (brahmins)" means "in the knowledgeable (brahmins)".
<i>Silapaññānanti sīlañca ñāṇañca na jānāsi.</i>	"Virtue (and) wisdom" means you do not know (the Buddha's) virtue as well as (His) wisdom.

<i>SNA 1.7.1.1. Dhanañjāniśuttavaṇṇanā²¹</i>	Commentary to SN 1.7.1.1. Discourse about Dhanañjāni ²²
<i>187. Brāhmaṇasamyuttassa paṭhame dhanañjānīti dhanañjānigottā.</i>	187. "Dhanañjānī" of the first (discourse) of Brāhmaṇa Samyutta means she is from the Dhanañjānī clan.
<i>Ukkatthagottā kiresā.</i>	Indeed, she is of an glorious clan.
<i>Sesabrahmaṇā kira brahmuno mukhato jātā, dhanañjānigottā matthakam bhinditvā nikkhantāti tesam laddhi.</i>	Other brahmins are indeed born from the Brahmā's mouth, those of the Dhanañjānī clan came out from the (Brahma's) broken head, they believed. ²³
<i>Udānam udānesīti kasmā udānesi?</i>	"Exclaimed an exclamation", why did (she) exclaim (it)?
<i>So kira brāhmaṇo micchādiṭṭhiko "buddho dhammo saṅgho"ti vutte kaṇne pidahati, thaddho khadirakhāṇusadiso.</i>	Indeed, that brahmin was of wrong view, covering (his) ears when (the brahmin woman) said "Buddha, Dhamma, Saṅgha", obdurate, like a stump of acacia tree.
<i>Brāhmaṇī pana sotāpannā ariyasāvikā.</i>	The brahmin woman was, however, a Stream-Enterer, a Noble Disciple.
<i>Brāhmaṇo dānam dento pañcasatānam brāhmaṇānam appodakam pāyāsaṁ deti, brāhmaṇī buddhappamukhassa saṅghassa nānārasabhojanam.</i>	When the brahmin gave donation to the five hundred brahmins, he gives milk-rice with little water, (whereas) the meal of the brahmin woman (donated) to the

²¹ This Commentary nicely illustrates the qualities of a lay woman as a Stream-Enterer, together with an issue that may arise when she lives with a non-Buddhist husband. I believe that the characteristics of a Stream-Enterer (esp. the unshakeable faith in the Buddha, Dhamma, and Saṅgha; complete devotion to them) possessed by a lay person will be clearly understood from this narrative.

²² The translation has been done according its Pāli-Burmese verbatim translation in "Thanyote Atṭhakathā Nisya" (သဏ္ဌာန်အဋ္ဌကတ္ထုနိသ္ထာ), vol.2, [author unknown], [publisher unknown], [year of publishing unknown]; pp.84-90.

²³ This is apparently a ridicule on the brahmins' conceited evolution history. Generally is believed (until today), that brahmins are born of the Brahma's mouth, whereas others are born of other bodily parts of Brahma. The name "Dhanañjānī" can be translated as "experiencing wealth".

	Community of monks headed by the Buddha (consists of various tastes).
<i>Brāhmaṇassa dānadivase brāhmaṇī tassa vasavattitāya pahīnamaccheratāya ca sahatthā parivisati.</i>	On the day of the brahmin's donation the brahmin woman serves (the brahmins) by her hand due to (her) compliance to him (i.e. her husband) as well as due to (her) absence of envy.
<i>Brāhmaṇiyā pana dānadivase brāhmaṇo pātova gharā nikkhemitvā palāyati.</i>	However, on the day of the brahmin woman's donation (to the Buddha and Saṅgha) the brahmin (i.e. her husband) left from the home early in the morning and scampered away.
<i>Athekadivasam brāhmaṇo brāhmaṇiyā saddhiṁ asammantetvā pañcasate brāhmaṇe nimantetvā brāhmaṇīm āha –</i>	Then on one day the brahmin, without consulting (that) with the brahmin woman, invited five hundred brahmins and told to the brahmin woman:
<i>"sve bhoti amhākām ghare pañcasatā brāhmaṇā bhuñjissanti"ti.</i>	"Lady, tomorrow five hundred brahmins will eat in our house."
<i>Mayā kiṁ kātabbam brāhmaṇāti?</i>	What should be done by me, brahmin? (Replied his wife.) ²⁴
<i>Tayā aññām kiñci kātabbam natthi, sabbam pacanaparivesanam aññe karissanti.</i>	There is no other duty to be done by you, other (people) will do all the cooking (and) serving.
<i>Yām pana tvām ṛhitāpi nisinnāpi khipitvāpi ukkāsitvāpi "namo buddhassā"ti tassa muñḍakassa samanakassa namakkāram karosi, tam sve ekadivasamattam mā akāsi.</i>	However, how you, either standing or sitting, sneezing, (or) coughing pay homage to that bald-headed ascetic (saying) "I bow to the Buddha", don't do that tomorrow just for a single day.
<i>Tam hi sutvā brāhmaṇā anattamanā honti, mā mam brāhmaṇehi bhindasīti.</i>	Indeed, if the brahmins hear that, they will be displeased; don't destroy my (reputation) among the brahmins.
<i>Tvām brāhmaṇehi vā bhijja devehi vā, aham pana satthāram anussaritvā na sakkomi anamassamānā sañthātunti.</i>	Your (reputation) shall be destroyed among brahmins, or among gods, I however can't stay remembering the Teacher and not paying respect (to Him).
<i>Bhoti kulasatike gāme gāmadvārampi tāva pidahitum vāyamanti, tvām dvīhaṅgulehi pidahitabbam mukham brāhmaṇānam bhojanakālamattam pidahitum na sakkosīti.</i>	Lady, (people at night) can try to close the village door of the village (where live) hundred families, (however) you can't close a mouth that could be closed by two fingers (even) just during the time when brahmins eat.
<i>Evam punappunam kathetvāpi so nivāretum asakkonto ussīsake ṛhāpitaṁ mañḍalaggakkaggam gahetvā –</i>	Even though speaking thus again and again, he (i.e. the brahmin) was unable to conclude (the talk), (hence he) took the dagger of rounded tip kept above (his) head, (and threatened) :
<i>"bhoti sace sve brāhmaṇesu nisinnesu tam muñḍasamanakām namassasi,</i>	"Lady, if you pay homage to that bald-headed ascetic tomorrow while the brahmins are sitting,
<i>imīnā tam khaggena pādatalato paṭṭhāya yāva kesamatthakā kalīram viya koṭṭetvā rāsim karissāmī"ti imam gātham abhāsi –</i>	I will chop (your body) from the soles of (your) feet until the hair of (your) head like a top sprout and make a pile (of it)." (Then) he pronounced this verse:

²⁴ The intention here is to show that unlike the brahmin husband, who couldn't stand even meeting with the Buddha and Saṅgha, the brahmin woman has no problem meeting with the brahmin's visitors, and is even open to serve them. It might be also interpreted to show the openness and support of Buddhists toward followers of other faiths.

" <i>Iminā maṇḍalaggena, pādato yāva matthakā; Kalīramiva chejjāmi, yadi miccham²⁵ na kāhasi.</i>	"By this (dagger's) rounded tip, from feet until the head; I will slice (you) like a top sprout, if you don't do (according to) my will.
" <i>Sace buddhoti bhaṇasi, sace dhammoti bhāsasi; Sace saṅghoti kittesi, jīvantī me nivesane</i> "ti.	"If you say "Buddho", if you speak "Dhammo", If you praise "Saṅgho", alive in my dwelling place."
<i>Ariyasāvikā pana pathavī viya duppakampā, sineru viya dupparivattiyā.</i>	The Noble Disciples, however, are difficult to shake like the earth, difficult to turn over like (the mountain) Sineru. ²⁶
<i>Sā tena nām evamāha –</i>	Then she spoke to him thus:
" <i>Sace me arīgamañgāni, kāmāṇ chejjasi brāhmaṇa; Nevāhaṁ viramissāmi, buddhasetṭhassa sāsanā.</i>	"If (you) brahmin willingly cut of my limbs, Even (then) I will not refrain from the Teaching of the Supreme Buddha.
" <i>Nāhaṁ okkā varadharā, sakkā rodhayitum jinā; Dhītāhaṁ buddhasetṭhassa, chinda vā māṇ vadhattu vā</i> "ti.	"I am not accomplished (or) carrying perfection, (I am) able to cry up to the Victor, I am a daughter of the Supreme Buddha, (whether you) cut me or slain me."
<i>Evaṁ dhanañjānigajjitaṁ nāma gajjantī pañca gāthāsatāni abhāsi.</i>	Thus roaring the so called "roar of Dhanañjānī", (she) spoke five hundred verses (in this manner). ²⁷
<i>Brāhmaṇo brāhmaṇīṁ parāmasitum vā paharitum vā asakkonto "bhoti yām te ruccati, tam karohī"ti vatvā khaggam sayane khipi.</i>	The brahmin, unable to touch or hit the brahmin woman, said: "lady, do as you like," and threw the dagger on the bed.
<i>Punadivase gehaṁ haritupalittam kārāpetvā lājāpuṇṇaghaṭamālāgandhādīhi tattha tattha alaṅkārāpetvā</i>	The next day (the brahmin) asked (the servants) to smear the house with cow dung ²⁸ , adorned (the house) here and there with parched corn, pots filled with water, flowers, etc.,
<i>pañcannam brāhmaṇasatānam navasappisakkhararamadhuyuttam appodakapāyāsam patiyādāpetvā kālam ārocāpesi.</i>	requested (his servants) to prepare milk-rice of little water combined with new ghee, new molasses, (and) new honey, and informed (the brahmins) that the time (is right to eat).

<i>Brāhmaṇīpi pātova gandhodakena sayam nhāyitvā sahassagghanakam ahatavattham nivāsetvā</i>	The brahmin woman, indeed, early in the morning took bath herself in perfumed water, clothed a new garment worth thousand (pieces of money),
--	--

²⁵ I suppose *miccham* is made of *me* + *iccham*.

²⁶ Sineru (or also Meru) is a mythical mountain believed to be in the center of the flat-earth world system, as taught by Hindu cosmology. Unfortunately, although the Buddhist masters had the psychic powers of levitation and clair-voyance, in the Pāli scriptures there is no mention of the false perceptions of the Hindus, nor any mention that the "world" may seem to be spherical. All the concept of Hindu cosmology has been entirely accepted by the Buddhist scriptures. The mythical mountain of Sineru (or Meru) is there described being in the very center of the disk-like flat earth, measuring 84 000 *yojanas* (one *yojana* is equivalent to ca.15 km) above the surface of water, and 84 000 *yojanas* below the surface of water. The mountain Sineru (or Meru) is visible only by psychic powers.

²⁷ Unfortunately, I am not able to find any more verses of Dhanañjānī's roar throughout the available Pāli scriptures.

²⁸ In ancient India cow dung was used as disinfectant, both inside houses and on roads as well.

<p>pañcasatagghanakam̄ ekam̄sañ katvā sabbālañkārapaññāñdītā suvaññakañacchum̄ gahetvā</p>	<p>Arranged ("made") (another garment) worth five-hundred (pieces of money) over one shoulder, adorned with all adornments (she) took a golden ladle,</p>
<p>bhattachge brāhmañe parivisamānā tehi saddhiñ ekapantiyam̄ nisinnassa tassa brāhmañassa bhattacham̄ upasam̄harantī dunnikkhitte dārubhañde pakkhali.</p>	<p>And as she was serving the brahmins in the refectory, she was carrying rice for a brahmin who was sitting with them (i.e. the other brahmins) together in the same row, and stumbled over a wrongly placed wooden piece of furniture.</p>
<p>Pakkhalanaghañtanāya dukkhā vedanā uppajji.</p>	<p>Because of the crash (caused by) stumbling, unpleasant feelings arose.</p>
<p>Tasmīñ samaye dasabalañ sari.</p>	<p>At that moment (she) remembered the One of Ten Powers²⁹.</p>
<p>Satisampannatāya pana pāyāsapātiñ achaddeñtvā sañikam̄ otāretvā bhūmiyam̄ sañthapetvā</p>	<p>However, because (she) was endowed with mindfulness, (she) didn't throw away the (golden) cup of milk-rice, putting (the cup) slowly down, and when (the cup) was well put on the ground,</p>
<p>pañcannam̄ brāhmañasatānam̄ majjhe sirasi añjaliñ thapetvā yena veļuvanam̄, tenañjaliñ pañāmetvā imam̄ udānam̄ udānesi.</p>	<p>In the midst of five hundred (non-Buddhist) brahmins, she placed (her erected) fingers on (her) head, directed (her) fingers where there was Bamboo Grove³⁰, and exclaimed the exclamation.</p>

<p>Tasmiñca samaye tesu brāhmañesu keci bhuttā honti, keci bhūñjamānā, keci hatthe otāritamattā, kesañci bhojanam̄ purato thapitamattam̄ hoti.</p>	<p>Also, at that moment some of those brahmins have already eaten, some were (still) eating, some have just put their hand into (their alms-bowls), some had the meal just placed in front of them.</p>
<p>Te tam̄ saddam̄ sutvā sinerumattena muggarena sise pahañā viya kaññesu sūlena viddhā viya dukkhadomanassam̄ pañisanñvediyamānā</p>	<p>Having heard that sound (of the exclamation), they experienced suffering (and) grief as if they were struck by a club of the size of the (mountain) Sineru, (or) pierced into (their) ears by a skewer,</p>
<p>"iminā aññaladdhikena mayam̄ gharam̄ pavesitā"ti kujjhitvā hatthe piñdam̄ chaddeñtvā mukhena gahitam̄ niñthubhitvā</p>	<p>And (saying) angrily: "We have entered a house of this man of different views" (they) threw the lump (of rice they had in their hand) from their hands, spat away what was in (their) mouths,</p>

²⁹ *Dasabala*, also known as *Tathāgatabala* are ten powers of the Buddha, mentioned and explained in different text throughout the Pāli scriptures. The most famous list is included in *MN 12. Mahāsihanāda Sutta*. In brief, they are: (1) the understanding of what is possible and what is impossible, (2) understanding of the result of action, (3) understanding the ways leading to all destinations (rebirth), (4) understanding the world with its many and different elements, (5) understanding the different inclinations of beings, (6) understanding the disposition of the faculties of other beings, (7) understanding the path to the attainment of jhānas and Enlightenment, (8) knowledge of His past lives, (9) understanding and vision of beings passing through death and life according to their actions, and (10) the attainment of the taintless deliverance of mind and deliverance by wisdom. (Written with help of Bhikkhu Bodhi's "The Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha, A Translation of Majjhima Nikāya", Wisdom Publications, Boston, 2005; p.165-166.)

³⁰ *Veļuvana* (Bamboo Grove) is apparently the place near her dwelling place where the Buddha stayed most often.

<p><i>dhanum disvā kākā viya brāhmaṇāṁ akkosamānā disāvidisā pakkamīṁsu.</i></p>	<p>Reviled the brahmin like a crow that saw a bow³¹ and left in different directions.</p>
<p><i>Brāhmaṇo evam bhijjītvā gacchante brāhmaṇe disvā brāhmaṇīṁ sīsato paṭṭhāya oloketvā,</i></p>	<p>When the brahmin's (reputation) was thus destroyed, as (he) saw the brahmins going away, (he) looked at the brahmin lady from her head (down),</p>
<p><i>"idameva bhayaṁ sampassamānā mayaṁ hiyyo paṭṭhāya bhotīṁ yācantā na labhimhā"ti nānappakārehi brāhmaṇīṁ akkositvā,</i></p>	<p>And blaming the brahmin lady in different ways (starting) : "Exactly this danger (I) presumed since yesterday, and (although) requesting the lady (to obey), we didn't receive (her obedience),</p>
<p><i>etam "evamevam panā"tiādīvacanāṁ avoca.</i></p>	<p>(He) said the words (of scolding) : "Thus indeed (this scoundrel)" etc.</p>

<p><i>Upasārikamīti "samaṇo gotamo gāmanigamaratṭhapūjito, na sakkā gantvā yam vā tam vā vatvā santajjeturū, ekameva naṁ pañham puccissāmī"ti</i></p>	<p>"Approached" means (thinking) : "the ascetic Gotama is revered by the village, town, (and) the country, it is not possible to go (there) and frighten (him) just by saying something; I will ask him just one question."</p>
<p><i>gacchantova "kiṁsu chetvā"ti gāthāṁ abhisarikharitvā – '</i></p>	<p>(And) already while going (he) made up the verse: "What (should) be destroyed (etc.)."</p>
<p><i>'sace 'asukassa nāma vadham roceṁīti vakkhati, atha naṁ 'ye tuyhaṁ na ruccanti, te māretukāmosi, lokavadhāya uppanno, kiṁ tuyhaṁ samaṇabhāvenā"ti? Niggahessāmī.</i></p>	<p>If he says: "I teach slaughter of this particular (person)," then I will censure him (saying) : "you want to kill those that don't appreciate you, (you) are (here) in order to kill human, why would you be an ascetic?"</p>
<p><i>Sace 'na kassaci vadham roceṁīti vakkhati, atha naṁ 'tvam rāgādīnampi vadham na icchasi. Kasmā samaṇo hutvā āhiṇḍasī"ti? Niggahessāmī.</i></p>	<p>If he says: "I do not teach slaughter of anything," then I will censure him (saying) : "you don't wish to slaughter (your) lust, etc. Why are (you) then roaming about as an ascetic?"</p>
<p><i>Iti imam ubhatokotikam pañham samaṇo gotamo neva gilitum na uggilitum sakkhissatī"ti cintetvā upasārikamī.</i></p>	<p>And thinking: "Thus the ascetic Gotama will be able neither to swallow up nor vomit this two-edged (sword-like) question," (the brahmin) approached (the Buddha).</p>

<p><i>Atha kho bhagavā kosalesu anupubbenā cārikāṁ caramāno yena cañcalikappam tadavasari.</i></p>	<p>Then the Exalted One, journeying on a gradual journey in (the city of) Kosala and settled there where was Cañcalikappa.</p>
<p><i>Tatra sudam bhagavā cañcalikappe viharati todeyyānam brāhmaṇānam ambavane.</i></p>	<p>There indeed, the Exalted One stays in Cañcalikappa, in the mango grove of the brahmins of Todeyya (clan).</p>
<p><i>Assosi kho dhanañjānī brāhmaṇī – "bhagavā kira cañcalikappam anupatto, cañcalikappe viharati todeyyānam brāhmaṇānam ambavane"ti.</i></p>	<p>Then the brahmin woman Dhanañjānī heard: "Really, the Exalted One has arrived to Cañcalikappa, He stays in Cañcalikappa, in the mango grove of the brahmins of Todeyya (clan).</p>
<p><i>Atha kho dhanañjānī brāhmaṇī yena saṅgāravo mānavo tenupasaṅkami; upasārikamītvā saṅgāravam mānavam etadavoca –</i></p>	<p>So, then the brahmin woman Dhanañjānī approached where there was the young man Saṅgārava; (and)</p>

³¹ I suppose this reflects the experience of the writer – at that time crows were shot by arrows (from bows), hence the crows learned to be scared of bows. It seems that crows at that time would fiercely cry when they saw a bow.

	having approached (him) (she) told to the young man Saṅgārava:
" <i>ayam, tāta bhadramukha, so bhagavā cañcalikappam anuppatto, cañcalikappe viharati todeyyānaṁ brāhmaṇānaṁ ambavane.</i>	"Now, dear beautiful-mouthed one, the Exalted One has arrived in Cañcalikappa, He stays in Cañcalikappa, in the mango grove of the brahmins of Todeyya (clan).
<i>Yassadāni, tāta bhadramukha, kālāṁ maññasi”ti.</i>	Now (you), dear beautiful-mouthed one, know the time of it.

May all beings be happy and healthy ☺

monk Sarañā